



W+ Verification Report

Water Bus/Globology

Lake Victoria - Kenya



VERIFICATION REPORT

Water Bus/Globology

Measuring the increase in Time and Income & Assets

Document Prepared by Liz Allen, Lisa McMullan and Faith Muniale – Social Audit Network

Project Title	Water Bus/Globology
Project Start Date	2010
Project End Date	Continuous
Verification Report number	Report 1.0
Project ID	01-2021
Project Developer	Water Bus/Globology

Report Title	Measuring the increase in Time and Income & Assets
Client	Shell Foundation
Units Generated	2,880 Income and Assets units generated 2,320 Time units generated
Pages	21



Date of Issue	18/2/22
Prepared By	Liz Allen, Lisa McMullan and Faith Muniale – Social Audit Network
Contact	Social Audit Network 54 St James Street, Liverpool, UK. L1 0AB
Approved By	Liz Allen
Work Carried Out By	Liz Allen and Faith Muniale– Social Audit Network

Verifier (auditor) Accreditation Status	Confirmed 2014
--	----------------

Summary:

The intention of the audit process was to verify the outcomes derived from the implementation of the W+ Income and Assets method and the Time method through the provision of the Waterbus at Lake Victoria.

The verification activity included in this report took place over three days in January and February 2022. It was undertaken by two SAN verifiers, Liz Allen and Faith Muniale during calls with the project developer as well as video calls with women using the Waterbus service, coupled with monitoring documents.

The verifiers met with the project lead Annie Wanjiru and with several women using the service; unfortunately, due to COVID restrictions the verifiers were not able to travel to the region to visit the project or the women that have been its beneficiaries and so have been reliant upon remote processes including video calls.

The purpose of the verification activity was to establish if the presence of the Waterbus has led to an increase in Income and Assets for the women and an increase in available Time. The verification also sought to validate the W+ Income and Assets and Time units created by this activity.

The monitoring period considered in the verification was November 2019-November 2021. A combination of methods was adopted in undertaking the verification including:

- Interview with Project Lead
- 1-2-1 Video calls with women using the Waterbus service

In addition, the verification team reviewed the following supporting documents:

- W+ Project design document
- Monitoring Report compiled by Barun Gurung on the 14th December 2021

A total of 400 women had benefitted from the activity and through the evidence provided the verification team felt that improvements had been made in the lives of the women participants both in terms of Income and Assets and in Time.

The Waterbus enables women who run small businesses on the islands to purchase and move stock, and for women who catch and sell fish, it ensures that they can reach the market with



fresh stock, where previously their stock could have been delayed or lost due to a lack of transport or dangerous canoe transport that risked capsizing. The quality of their stock now ensures they can command higher market prices increasing their income and assets. The efficiency of a reliable transport service also frees up time for them to be able to do other things for themselves and their families and it ensures that they are always able to get safely back to the islands.

The Waterbus enables the women to travel from the islands to the mainland to visit their families, attend health appointments, access improved schools for their children, access other employment opportunities, and make recreational visits.

Some women also identified that the Waterbus greatly reduced the threat to women and girls in their community from men who sexually harass them, the women are no longer relying upon favours from other fishermen in order to move from the islands to the mainland and so are at much less risk of harassment.

The staff who manage the Waterbus are friendly and welcoming and are trained in all aspects of health and safety as well as first aid meaning that the women who use the service feel safe and cared for, in fact four women travelling to hospital have given birth on the Waterbus and all have been safe arrivals. One woman who is employed to run a small shop on the waterbus is disabled and would have struggled to find alternative employment, as such the Waterbus provides both work and opportunities to feel a part of a busy community.

The women using the Waterbus also shared how they have used the extra time that they have gained, they reported a range of activities including helping their children with their studies, undertaking extra work and income generating activity, as well as social and recreational activity.

This is clearly a change from the way the women were living previously and as such the verification team feel comfortable to certify this programme and recommend its continuation.



Table of Contents

Section	Content	Page Number
1	Introduction	8
1.1	Objective	8
1.2	Scope and Criteria	8
1.3	Level of Assurance	8
1.4	Project Monitoring and Evaluation Report Summary	9
2	Verification Process	11
2.1	Method and Criteria	11
2.2	Document Review	11
2.3	Interviews	11
2.4	Site Inspections	13
2.6	Resolution of Findings	13
2.7	Forward Action Requests	14
3	Validation Findings	13
3.1	Project Description Deviations W+ Project Eligibility	13
3.2	W+ Project Eligibility Method Deviations	13
3.3	Method Deviations	13
4	Verification Findings	14
4.1	Project Implementation Status	14
4.2	Accuracy of Calculations of Women's Empowerment Benefits	14
4.3	Quality of Evidence to Determine Women's Empowerment Benefits	15
5	W+ Results	16
5.1	W+ Domains	16
5.2	Direct Payment Mechanism	18
6	Analysis of W+ Results	18



6.1	Current Performance	18
6.2	Non-Permanence Risks	19
7	Verification (Audit) Conclusion	19

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Objective

The intention of the audit process was to verify the outcomes derived from the implementation of the W+ Income and Assets method and the Time method through the Globology Waterbus in Fangano Island, Homa Bay County, Kenya. The verification activity included in this report took place over three days in January 2022.

1.2. Scope and Criteria

The scope of the audit was limited to the W+ Income and Assets and Time domains and considered the following indicators as evidence of successful implementation:

- An increase in time savings that is significant to allocate to other activities
- Travel time saved that can be spent in helping children with their studies, undertaking income generating activities, participating in social and recreational activities
- A large proportion of women perceive that their income has increased
- The Time saved through using Water Bus provides opportunities for women to generate additional income and assets.
- Women users perceive better well-being through using Water Bus

Additionally, a Do No Harm indicator was sought to evidence that “no less than 97% of both men and women report that the project has not denied them access to participate in the activities through a selection process that excluded them

1.3. Level of Assurance

The following table summarises the findings of this verification report

W+ Domain	Desired Outcome	No Change (0)	Somewhat Better (+1)	Much Better (+2)	Very Much Better (+3)
Time	The time saved is reallocated meaningfully				+3
	Increased decision making by women				+3
Income and Assets	Increase in assets				+3
	Increase in perception				+3



	of well-being				
--	---------------	--	--	--	--

The stakeholder engagement process evidences the descriptors outlined above. This is coupled with statistical analysis of numeric data gathered from stakeholder questionnaires undertaken by the project monitoring team that also evidence increased income and assets and increased time savings.

The level of assurance gained is in light of the project duration to date and the opportunity to improve control over decision making through the development of the women’s roles in their communities – the safe reliable travel provided by the Waterbus enables them to be more effective business women, their ability to generate their own income gives them a sense of independence and they have greater respect from the community. There is a clear improvement from the baseline of limited income and assets due to unreliable and unsafe transport options to get their produce to the markets, and limited time for alternative activities because journeys were unreliable and at the control of the fishermen who provided transport as a favour.

These improvements justify the assurance level of 3.

1.4. Project Monitoring & Evaluation Report Summary

The Shell Foundation commissioned the WOCAN W+ team to apply the W+ standard over two domains (Income & Assets and Time) to the Waterbus Service, delivered from 2010 and ongoing.

The Income and Assets method and the time method was applied based on the following anticipated results:

- Women report increased incomes
- Women report increased assets
- Women report increased discretionary time
- Women reallocate the time saved in a meaningful way
- Women have increased decision making power
- Women report an increased perception of their positive well-being

These outcomes were to be achieved through

- the provision of the Waterbus service offering safe and reliable transport between the islands and the mainland

The application of the two domain areas show that there is a positive achievement for 400 women. When applied to the total number of project beneficiaries that have benefitted from the Waterbus. The total number of units generated under the Time domain is 2,880 Time units. The total Income and Assets units generated over the monitoring period is 2,320 Income and



Assets units giving a total of 5,200 W+ units generated by the programme of activity.

W+ Units Generated:

1 W+ unit = 10% change in one woman's life in one domain over the monitoring period

TIME SAVED: 2,880 units

The results between the control group and the beneficiaries show an increase of 72% per woman over the period of 24 months.

72% = 7.2 units per woman. Number of women x 7.2 = 400 x 7.2 = 2,880 W+ Time Saved units for 400 women.

INCOME AND ASSETS: units

The results between the control group and the beneficiaries show an increase of 58% per woman over the period of 24 months.

58% = 5.8 units per woman. Number of women x 5.8 = 400 x 5.8 = 2,320 Income and Assets units for 400 women.

The total amount of combined W+ units generated by the project is **2,880 Time saved units + 2,320 Income and Assets units = 5,200.**

In addition, there has been challenge to the social asymmetries associated with gender roles and decision making as a consequence of the safe and reliable transport provided by the Waterbus. This appears to be a sustainable change given the Waterbus has been running for 12 years now but it will continue to be a consideration in all future evaluation cycles.

2. VERIFICATION PROCESS

2.1. Method and Criteria

This verification report is limited to consideration of two W+ domains, Income and Assets, and Time. Monitoring data has been gathered from field research and this data has been verified through the use of two approaches

- Examination of the data gathered and consideration of its accuracy and consideration of the two domain methods
- Interviews and 1-2-1 calls to:
 - Verify the presence of the Waterbus and its service
 - Conduct interviews with a number of women who use the Waterbus
 - Interview the Project Developer supporting the implementation of the programme

2.2. Document Review

The following documents were reviewed in order to complete the verification of the Income and Assets; and Time domain results for the Waterbus:

Method documents for the two domains

- W+ Project Design Document
- Monitoring report – 14/12/21
- Formula calculation for the statistical analysis of surveys undertaken

Each document was crosschecked against the others and with the findings from the interviews to ensure consistency and accuracy. This was done following the interviews and these adequately reinforced the findings presented.

The findings from interviews informed the score applied to the programme and its assurance level of 2 (much improvement).

2.3. Interviews

An initial interview took place with the Project Developer on the 10th February 2022, followed by 1-2-1 video calls with a number of women who use the Waterbus service on the 12th February 2022.

During the calls discussions were intended to verify the findings presented in the Monitoring Report 14/12/21.

The discussions were facilitated by Faith Muniale, an experienced community facilitator. The discussions were structured around a series of questions devised by the verification team in order to elicit responses that could prove/disprove the findings of the Monitoring Report. The questions listed below were arranged as higher level and supplementary questions and acted as a guide rather than being prescriptive, to ensure flexibility and for facilitator to gain insights into the reported experiences of the women.

Higher Level Questions

- Why do the women use the Waterbus?
- Has the Waterbus made travel easier for them?
- What are they able to do now that they couldn't before the Waterbus service?
- Have they seen an increase in their income and/or assets as a result of being able to use the Waterbus service?
- How do they use the extra time they have now?
- Do they believe that their own wellbeing is improved as a result of being able to use the waterbus service?

Supplementary Questions

- Who makes the decisions around how they spend money in the household?
- What are they using the additional income for?
- Is there anything else we need to hear?

From these conversations it was clear that:

- The women who run businesses on the island and have to get supplies from the mainland, need to cross every day to get fresh supplies of fruits and vegetables. The waterbus has made it easier and safer for them to do this ensuring they have good quality stock for sale leading to increased income.
- The women are able to visit relatives on the main land and for those with small children they felt it was a much safer service to use than the old canoe style boats that were unstable and dangerous. For some women the time they saved by using the waterbus enabled them to visit family and have more social interactions more frequently.
- The women employed by the Waterbus service enjoy their roles and the interactions with customers throughout the day, they have received training in all operational aspects and they receive wages now that has increased their income, additionally it provides a source of income for a disabled woman who runs the shop on the waterbus.
- The women use the Waterbus to get to medical appointments on the mainland because there are no medical services on the islands, as a result their health and wellbeing is improved because they can be sure that the Waterbus will run on time and they won't miss appointments.

-
- The team that run the Waterbus care about their passengers, there have been 4 births and sadly 1 death on the Waterbus and the project provided counseling for the passengers that were on board during the incident, and organised for support due the trauma the team and the family went through. So, beyond the transport service, the project has a general approach to ensure the women are comfortable.

2.4. Site Inspections

Due to ongoing travel restrictions no site visits were able to take place.

2.5. Resolution of Findings

There were no corrective actions of clarifications required during the verification process

2.6. Forward Action Requests

Ongoing delivery of the programme will enable more women to use the service and benefit from the opportunities independent travel affords them

To make sure passengers enjoy their journey in the Water Bus other services could be introduced including:

- En-route travel entertainment like TV
- Wireless internet access

3. VALIDATION FINDINGS

3.1. Project Description Deviations

There are no deviations from the project description.

3.2. Project Eligibility of any new activities initiated during monitoring period

The project meets the eligibility criteria for consideration under the W+ standard. The verification team has explored the methods (Income & Assets and Time) and after checking the method document to this data and interviews it can confidently state that the method has been effectively validated and applied.

3.3. Method Deviations

There are no method deviations identified or applied to this programme.

4. VERIFICATION FINDINGS

4.1. Project Implementation Status

The project has been implemented in line with the project description. The project has been monitored effectively using appropriate sampling techniques, individual surveys and site visits. There are no material discrepancies between the actual monitoring system and the monitoring plan set out in the project description and the applied W+ methods. The verification team can confidently confirm that the project has been implemented as described in the project description.

4.2. Accuracy of Calculations of Women's Empowerment Benefits

Process for calculating the number of W+ units

1) Measurement of results: The formula of each domain is applied two times: at the time of the baseline survey, and again at the time of the monitoring survey (determined by the schedule established in the Project Design Document (PDD)). **The difference between the two numbers is the quantified result that is used to determine the number of W+ units generated.**

2) Calculation of the percentage of change= [$\frac{\text{Result} - \text{Baseline}}{\text{Baseline}}$] x 100

3) Calculation of the number of W+ units

1 unit = 10 % improvement in one woman's life, in relation to one domain over the monitoring period.

Total number of units= percentage of change x number of woman beneficiaries

As described in the Monitoring Report 14/12/21, data has been checked, no manual transposition errors have been identified and all calculations are good.

The calculation of the units has been completed using the original arithmetic methods identifying change from the baseline and the percentage change of the participant group against a control group.

The values applied are real values taken from the survey data and from market values and the verification team is confident that the women's empowerment benefits have been quantified correctly in accordance with the project description and applied W+ method(s).

4.3 Quality of Evidence to Determine Women's Empowerment Benefits

The evidence used to determine the women's empowerment benefits are:

- The Monitoring Report 14/12/21 including the explanation of data flows from data generation to data aggregation and unit calculation.
- Statistical analysis of survey data
- Interviews with women using the Waterbus Service
- Interviews with the Project Developer
- The quality of the information gathered in the Monitoring Report is excellent and was obtained using a professional researcher/enumerator. As such the information is comprehensive and reliable.
- The process of converting data from written to electronic formats is considered to be accurate and the information deduced from the data set is considered to be comprehensive and reliable.
- The information gathered from the discussions and interviews is considered to be excellent in its reliability and rigour as it is source data from the women. An Expert facilitated the conversations, who has considerable experience in ethnographic research techniques.

Overall, the quality and quantity of evidence is considered to be appropriate and comprehensive, ensuring the voice of the person served is heard and that the data set gained during monitoring activity reflects the findings from stakeholders.

5. W+ RESULTS

5.1. W+ Domains

Method (W+ Domain)	<i>Income and Assets</i>
Indicator	<p><i>A large proportion of women perceived that their income has increased and they have gained assets as a result of sales of products facilitated by the Waterbus service.</i></p> <p><i>Time saved through using Water Bus provided opportunities for women to generate additional income and assets.</i></p> <p><i>Women users perceived better wellbeing through using Water Bus</i></p>
Situation	<i>High levels of women reported a significant increase in their income as a result of the Waterbus service and there are plans to expand the service in the future ensuring more women can access the opportunities afforded by a safe and reliable service.</i>
Justification	<p><i>During the verification it was evident that the findings of the evaluation team were thorough and comprehensive.</i></p> <p><i>The women engaged by the verifiers reported increased income and increased opportunities, as well as increased health and wellbeing.</i></p> <p><i>As a result, it is considered that this outcome has been evidenced and the circumstances of the women has become very much better and is scored as 3.</i></p>
Evidence	<p><i>Monitoring report</i></p> <p><i>Statistical analysis of survey data</i></p> <p><i>1-2-1 calls with Female Waterbus users</i></p> <p><i>Interview with Project Developer</i></p>

Method (W+ Domain)	<i>Time</i>
Indicator	<i>The increase in time savings is significant to allocate to other activities Travel time saved that can be spent in helping children with their studies, undertaking income generating activities, participating in social and recreational activities</i>
Situation	<i>A very high percentage change in time saved was evidenced, the equivalent of an additional 17.25 days per annum.</i>

Justification	<i>The women reported meaningful use of their additional free time to visit their families and friends and undertake other income generating activity. As a result, it is considered that this outcome has been evidenced and the circumstances of the women has become very much better and is scored as 3.</i>
Evidence	<i>Monitoring report Statistical analysis of survey data 1-2-1 calls with Female enumerators Interview with Project Developer</i>

5.2. Direct Payment Mechanism

The verifiers are aware that the Project developer has identified two types of community based systems of savings and loans for women that can be used for the benefit-sharing mechanism required for the W+ Standard:

Table banking: is a group-based funding strategy in which members form groups where they can save and borrow money immediately during meeting times. Members of a table- banking group save money each time they meet from which they can take either short or long term loans.

Merry go round: also known as *chama* is a small social organization where members contribute a small sum of money on a regular basis, often every week. Each time money is collected, the full sum is paid out to one of the members. By participating, members are essentially putting money away until it comes back to them as a larger sum.

As yet there have been no sale of units and so no direct payments to the communities.

6. ANALYSIS OF W+ RESULTS

6.1. Current Performance

This verification focused upon two domains, Income & Assets and Time so a score of zero has been applied to all other domains. That is not to say that the project has not had positive effects upon other domains but merely that these have not been subject to verification.

Income and Assets – average score 3

Time – average score 3

Overall project score ---3

The scores reflect consideration of all of the evidence provided to the verification team coupled with findings from the interviews and feedback. The project is performing well, but the Project Developer recognises that there is scope to do more.

The strengths of the project lie in the ambition of women in the island communities to develop small businesses and have secure incomes from these businesses; to access education for their children, to visit their families and friends and to increase their wellbeing. The Waterbus enables them to do all of this and they are building happy and healthy lives as a result. It is the belief of the verification team that over time this will only deepen and will lead to even more positive outcomes for the women of the region.



W+ Domain	No Change (0)	Somewhat Better (+1)	Much Better (+2)	Very Better	Much
-----------	------------------	-------------------------	---------------------	-------------	------

				(+3)
Income & Assets	0	0	0	3
Time	0	0	0	3
Education & Knowledge	0	0	0	0
Leadership	0	0	0	0
Food Security	0	0	0	0
Health	0	0	0	0

6.2. Non-Permanence Risk Analysis

The verification team do not see any non-continuity risks at this time. The service has been very successful and it is the view of the verification team that the plans to expand the Waterbus service can only be positive for the women and the communities of the region.

7. VERIFICATION (AUDIT) CONCLUSION

The project complies with the verification criteria for projects and their women’s empowerment benefits as set out in W+ Standard and Program Guide. The verification team can confirm that the project has been implemented in accordance with the project description.

The total number of W+ units achieved by the project during the verification period is 5,200. The project complies with the verification criteria for projects set out in the W+ Standard. W+ verification period: From *November 2019 to November 2021*.

Net women’s empowerment benefits	Year/Month	Baseline	Project benefits
Increased income as a result of women small business owners being able to perform effectively and efficiently through access to	Verification Period 1	2,880 Income and Assets units generated	Increased income and assets



safe and reliable transport			
Increased available time to use in a meaningful way with family, friends and income generating activity.	Verification Period 1	2,320 Time units generated	Increased available time
	Total	5,200 W+ units generated	

Signed, February 20th 2022

Liz Allen